

NARUC-NASEO TASK FORCE NASEO **ON COMPREHENSIVE ELECTRICITY PLANNING**



Task Force Member States: Introductory Information April 2019

Table of Contents

Figure 1. Comparison of Task Force Member States by Planning Approaches and Market Models	2
Task Force Member State Summaries	
Arizona	3
Arkansas	4
California	5
Colorado	6
Hawaii	7
Indiana	8
Maryland	9
Michigan	10
Minnesota	11
North Carolina	12
Ohio	13
Puerto Rico	14
Rhode Island	15
Utah	16
Virginia	17

Figure 1. Comparison of Task Force Member States by Planning Approaches and Market Models

This figure summarizes member states planning approaches, including resource and distribution planning, and market models, including retail, wholesale, and capacity market.

				Proceeding	ion			
	Does	RP AC	we Dist Parrith Retail	-onpetition	uns carefai	Nativet		
	Approa	ich	М	arket Mod	el			
Arizona	•	0	0	•	0			
Arkansas	•	•	0	•	\bigcirc			
California	•	•	\bigcirc	\bigcirc	\bigcirc			
Colorado	•	Θ	0	•	0			
Hawaii	•	•	0	•	0			
Indiana	•	0	0	•	$\overline{}$			
Maryland	0	•	•	0	•			
Michigan	•	•	\bigcirc	•	\bigcirc			
Minnesota	•	•	0	•	\bigcirc			
North Carolina	•	0	0	•	0			
Ohio	0	•	•	\bigcirc	•			
Puerto Rico	•	0	0	•	0			
Rhode Island	0		•	0	•	Key	Yes	
Utah	•	0	0	•	0		Partial	Θ
Virginia		0	\bigcirc				No	0

Figure Notes:

 "Active Dist. Planning Proceeding" indicates states with an open proceeding that includes distribution system planning in its scope. Colorado is indicated as "partial" because it recently closed a relevant proceeding and may open a future proceeding.
"Retail Competition" indicates states where retail choice is available to all customers. Michigan allows retails choice up to 10% of

retail sales, and Virginia offers retail choice to residential customers only. California also allows 10% retail access or community choice aggregation (CCA).

³ "IOU Owns Generation" indicates states that are vertically integrated and own generation. In California, IOUs own legacy generation and in Ohio, one IOU (DP&L) owns generation.

⁴ "Capacity Market" indicates states in which system operators procure capacity commitments in a market structure. CAISO and MISO have a mechanism to manage some aspects of capacity and are considered partial.



Utility Commission: The Arizona Corporation Commission (ACC) reviews and acknowledges the Integrated Resource Plans (IRP) prepared by load-serving entities every 2-years. The ACC also determines modeling assumptions, and establishes state renewables and energy efficiency targets.



Power & Renewables Data

	Description	Status	Source
	Resource planning and procurement changes,	Natural gas plant	
Resource	including pending natural gas plants moratorium	moratorium	ACC
Planning	and pending rulemaking to modify existing energy	reinstated until	ACC
	rules, including energy resources planning.	August 1, 2019	



Utility Commission: The Arkansas Public Service Commission (PSC) acknowledges utilities' informational Integrated Resource Plans (IRP) covering at least a 20-year period, including a near-term action plan. IRPs are filed every three years, unless utilities choose to file more frequently.

State Energy Office: The Department of Environmental Quality's Energy Office (DEQ-EO) promotes energy efficiency, clean technology, and sustainable strategies to encourage energy security, economic development, and environmental well-being for Arkansas residents. DEQ-EO administers several incentive programs and partners with IOUs for energy efficiency programs.



	Description	Status	Source
Distribution Planning	Docket 16-028-U investigates DER-related policies, including data access issues.	Docket open; information gathering phase	PSC
Distribution Planning	Docket 16-027-R gathers information to determine appropriate rates, T&C, and necessary changes to net metering rules.	Docket open; utility rate schedule submitted for review	PSC



Utility Commission: The California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) reviews, modifies, and approves individual IOU's Integrated Resources Plans (IRP), Distribution Resources Plans (DRP), Grid Needs Assessments (GNA), and Distribution Deferral Opportunity Reports (DDOR). The CPUC also certifies IRP for Community Choice Aggregators (CCA) and approves IRPs for energy service providers.

State Energy Office: The California Energy Commission (CEC) regulates publicly-owned utilities (POUs). The CEC develops, along with the California Independent System Operator (CAISO), the forecast and planning assumptions used in the IRP and the DRP processes.



	Description	Status	Source
Resource Planning	R. 14-08-013, Decision 18-02-018 requires load-serving entities to file individual IRPs and establishes a 2-year IRP cycle process.	Decision filed in February 2018	CPUC
Distribution Planning	R. 14-08-013, Decision 18-02-004 requires IOUs to file GNAs by June 1 and DDORs by September 1, annually.	Decision filed in February 2018	CPUC

COLORADO

AGENCY ROLES

Utility Commission: The Colorado Public Utilities Commission (PUC) reviews, approves, and/or modifies the Phase I Electric Resource Plans (ERPs) prepared by utilities every 4 years, covering a 20 to 40 year planning horizon. Competitive solicitation then occurs. In Phase II a preferred resource portfolio is approved, based on modeling of bid data using the Phase I-approved modeling parameters. The PUC also reviews, approves, and/or modifies utilities' DSM and RES Compliance Plans.

State Energy Office: The Colorado Energy Office has a variety of responsibilities, including formally engaging with the PUC as an intervenor on electricity-related proceedings, working closely with the legislature on electricity legislation, and running state-level clean energy finance and grant programs.



	Description	Status	Source
Resource and Distribution Planning	Resource planning, renewable energy standard compliance, and interconnections now being addressed via a NOPR.	Proceeding No. 19R- 0096E open	PUC
Storage Procurement	HB18-1270 directed the PUC to adopt rules establishing storage procurement mechanisms for IOUs by February 2019.	Law passed	Legislature



Utility Commission: The Hawaii Public Utilities Commission (PUC) regulates all three subsidiaries of the state's investor-owned utility, Hawaiian Electric, as well as the Kaua'i Island Utility Cooperative. Once the new Integrated Grid Planning (IGP) process begins, the PUC will review, modify, and approve or reject company filings, as it did previously in the IRP and Power Supply and Improvement Plan (PSIP) processes.

State Energy Office: The State Energy Office (SEO) supports efforts to devise and deploy statewide clean energy plans, policies, and strategies, including providing technical assistance, financing support, and other resources for renewable energy and electric vehicle (EV) infrastructure development. SEO also reviews and files comments to the Commission regarding planning proceedings.



Power & Renewables Data

	Description	Status	Source
Resources and Distribution Planning	Docket 2018-0165 initiated the development of a new integrated grid planning (IGP) process, combining generation, transmission, and distribution planning into a unified 2-year cycle.	PUC approved HECO's IGP workplan on March 14, 2019	PUC
Performance- Based Regulation (PBR)	Docket 2018-0088 opened to establish PBR parameters following a statewide mandate.	PUC to issue Phase I decision in Upcoming months	PUC



Utility Commission: The Indiana Utility Regulatory Commission (IURC) regulates electric utilities, including oversight and review of the Integrated Resource Plan (IRP) and the Transmission, Distribution, and Storage System Improvement Charge (TDSIC) filing.

State Energy Office: The Office of Energy Development (OED) coordinates state energy policy with executive branch agencies, houses energy-related programs, and works to support a strong, comprehensive, coordinated energy plan for Indiana.



Source: ICF Analysis of EIA and Wood Mackenzie Power & Renewables Data

	Description	Status	Source
Distribution Planning	Encourages utilities to submit 7-year plans for eligible transmission, distribution, and storage system improvements, including routine maintenance and operational issues as part of distribution system planning.	Passed in 2013; legislation currently pending would amend original statute	General Assembly



Utility Commission: The Maryland Public Service Commission (PSC) has jurisdiction over electricity companies and suppliers. The Commission oversees the energy efficiency programs and the implementation of the State's RPS. The PSC submits the 10-Year Plans annually to the Secretary of the Department of Natural Resources. The Commission also oversees the Public Conference (PC) 44 proceeding on grid modernization.

State Energy Office: The Maryland Energy Administration (MEA) advices the Governor and the General Assembly on matters relating to energy policy.



Power & Renewables Data

	Description	Status	Source
Resource and Transmission Planning	MPSC, Ten-Year Plan (2018-2027) of Electric Companies in Maryland	December 2018	Legislature
Distribution Planning	Public Conference 44 (PC44) Transforming Maryland's Electric Grid proceeding includes distribution system planning as one of six topics.	Opened in September 2016	PSC



Utility Commission: The Michigan Public Service Commission (MPSC) reviews Integrated Resource Plans (IRP) prepared by utilities every 5 years. Separately, the MPSC reviews Investment and Maintenance Distribution Plans prepared by utilities every 2 years. Distribution plans were reviewed for the first time in early 2018.

State Energy Office: The Michigan Agency for Energy designs and implements programs that can support the distribution system, and facilitates conversation among stakeholders, including munis and coops, on important energy policy issues.



Power & Renewables Data

	Description	Status	Source
Resource Planning	PA 341 (Section 6t) enacted a new IRP process.	Passed December 2016	Legislature, Governor
Distribution Planning	Docket (U-20147) for certain regulated electric utilities to file 5-year distribution investment and maintenance plans.	Opened April 2018	MPSC

MINNESOTA

AGENCY ROLES

Utility Commission: The Minnesota Public Utilities Commission (PUC) reviews, approves, and/or modifies utilities' Integrated Resource Plans (IRP) covering at least a 15-year period along with a 5-year action plan. The PUC also reviews utilities' 10-year Integrated Distribution Plans (IDPs), filed annually by Xcel and biannually by other utilities, and utilities' biannual, jointly-filed State Transmission Plan. The PUC participates through the Organization of MISO States on regional and federal matters.

State Energy Office: The Regulation and Planning Unit, Division of Energy Resources within the Department of Commerce (DOC), advocates on behalf of the public interest before the Commission, including rate cases, resource plans, and certificates of need, as well as in regional and federal matters. DER also provides technical expertise and support to the Commission on large energy project siting and routing and conducts the environmental reviews required for such projects through the Energy Environmental Review and Analysis unit.



	Description	Status	Source
Distribution Planning	Docket CI-18-251 established distribution planning filing requirements for Xcel, formalizing the structure of IDP; CI-18-253, -254, and 255 established IDP filing requirements for Otter Tail Power, Minnesota Power, and Dakota Electric.	Stakeholders submitted comments on Xcel's first IDP filing. OTP, MP and DEA plans are due November 1, 2019	PUC
e21 Initiative	Industry stakeholders collaborating on new integrated systems planning processes.	Public forum on planning held in December 2018	e21/Great Plains Institute

NORTH CAROLINA

AGENCY ROLES

Utility Commission: The North Carolina Utilities Commission (NCUC) determines content and data to be included in Integrated Resource Plans (IRP). In addition, NCUC reviews and accepts or requires modification to utility IRP.

Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) / Energy Policy Council: The DEQ is only involved with planning in the context of the Energy Policy Council and other energy program initiatives. For example, the Energy Policy Council is responsible for developing the state energy plan, which must be consistent with the IRP



|--|

	Description	Status	Source
Resource/Dist. Planning	Three major IOUs submit IRP with a 15-year planning horizon, including analysis of supply and demand resources. Smart Grid Technology Plans (SGTP) filed with IRP.	Due September 1 and October 1, 2020	Legislature
Resource Planning	Per Executive Order 80, the DEQ will develop the Clean Energy Plan which will consider integration of DER to facilitate development of a modern and resilient electric grid.	Due October 1, 2019	Governor's Office



Utility Commission: The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (PUCO) annually develops a 20-year energy forecast needs for the Governor and General Assembly (Long-term Forecast Report – LTFR).

Development Services Agency: The Ohio Development Services Agency runs the Energy Efficiency Program which helps businesses, manufacturers, nonprofits, schools and local governments reduce energy use and improve energy efficiency. The energy office is focused on implementation and not planning.



Power & Renewables Data

	Description	Status	Source
Resource Planning	Electric utilities file annual 10-year forecast reports.	Annual reports by April 15	Legislature
Resource Planning	PUCO staff develop Long-term Forecast Report (LTFR).	Annual (no date)	Legislature
Distribution Planning	PowerForward: A Roadmap to Ohio's Electricity Future established 3 groups, including Distribution System Planning. Requires IOUs to file a current state planning assessment.	Reports due April 1, 2019	Commission

PUERTO RICO

AGENCY ROLES

Utility Commission: The Puerto Rico Energy Bureau (PREB) reviews and approves the Integrated Resource Plan filed every three years.

Puerto Rico Energy Policy Program: The Puerto Rico Energy Policy Program (PREPP) establishes energy efficiency parameters for state energy offices and municipalities.



Power Authority data

	Description	Status	Source
Resource Planning	"Regulation on IRP for PREPA" updates IRP framework and filing requirements	February 8, 2019	Commission
	Docket NEPR-AP-2018-0001 authorizes		
	PREPA to file IRPs more frequently than every	Opened April 2018	Commission
	3-years with Commission approval		

RHODE ISLAND

AGENCY ROLES

Utility Commission: The Public Utilities Commission comprises two distinct regulatory agencies: a 3-member Commission (Commission) and the Division of Public Utilities and Carriers (Division). The Commission reviews and approves Infrastructure, Safety, and Reliability (ISR), Energy Efficiency (EE) plans, and System Reliability Procurement (SRP) filings for National Grid, and also provided input on the Power Sector Transformation (PST) initiative. The Division represents ratepayer interests in all dockets before the Commission, enforces the Commission's orders, and has its own separate authority, rules, and jurisdiction over certain regulatory issues.

State Energy Office: The Office of Energy Resources (OER) is the lead agency on energy policy/programs, working with the Commission, Division, and others on initiatives such as the PST and the State Energy Plan.



	Description	Status	Source
Integrated	Docket 4539 ordered National Grid to	Docket closed following	
Planning	consider DER in long-range planning,	approval of National	Commission
i lanning	including beneficial locations/heat maps.	Grid 2016 ISR filing	
	Power Sector Transformation includes,		Division of Public
Distribution	distribution system planning as one of	Phase One report	Utilities and Carriers
Planning	four work streams to continue	published in 2017	and Office of Energy
	modernization of the state electric system.		Resources



Utility Commission: The 3-member Utah Public Service Commission (UPSC) ensures safe, reliable, adequate, and reasonably priced utility service, including reviewing and acknowledging Integrated Resource Plans (IRP), and conducting hearings and investigations of utility company operations to determine just and reasonable rates. The Utah Division of Public Utilities (DPU) is an independent agency that makes recommendations to UPSC on rate-making, applications, hearings, and other issues affecting utility service, including IRPs.

State Energy Office: The Governor's Office of Energy Development (OED) was created in 2011 under the Governor's 10-Year Strategic Energy Plan, and provides industry assistance, education and outreach, and policy solutions to promote resource diversity and innovation to advance all forms of responsible, affordable, reliable, and sustainable energy.



Power & Renewables Data

	Description	Status	Source
Regional Planning	Goal 8 of State Energy Action Plan, "Expand Regional Engagement," includes analysis for broadening regional electricity markets as the sector increasingly uses variable renewable resources.	Final plan published in 2018	Governor's Office of Energy Development



Utility Commission: The Virginia State Corporation Commission (SCC) reviews Integrated Resource Plans (IRP) through public proceedings and evaluates them as to whether they are reasonable and in the public interest for the specific and limited purpose of filing the planning document.

State Energy Office: The Department of Mines, Minerals, and Energy (DMME) prepares the State Energy Plan and supports integrating distribution planning with IRP. In addition, DMME develops and manages energy financing programs that support renewable energy, energy efficiency, and advanced transportation projects and programs.



	Description	Status	Source
Resource Planning	Code of Virginia § 56-599 enacted the Integrated resource plan requirement for utilities every 3-years with a 15-year planning horizon.	Effective July 1, 2018	Legislature
Distribution Planning	Grid Transformation and Security Act requires IOUs to file distribution grid modernization plans.	Enacted March 9, 2018	Legislature